

1 SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
2 COUNTY OF NEW YORK: CRIMINAL TERM: PART 85

3 -----x
4 PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK

5 SORA Hearing

6 -against-

7 Indictment No.
8 00745-1990

9 SAMUEL SANCHEZ,

10 Defendant.
11 -----x

12 New York Supreme Court
13 111 Centre Street
14 New York, New York 10013

15 September 14, 2016

16 B E F O R E:

17 HONORABLE ROGER S. HAYES, Justice of the Supreme Court

18 A P P E A R A N C E S:

19 FOR THE PEOPLE:

20 CYRUS R. VANCE, JR., ESQ.
21 District Attorney of New York County
22 BY: DAVID FILER, ESQ.

23 FOR THE DEFENDANT:

24 CENTER FOR APPELLATE LITIGATION
25 Attorneys for Defendant
BY: LAUREN SPRINGER, ESQ.
MOLLY SCHINDLER, ESQ. (via video conference)

Lisa Mango
Senior Court Reporter

Proceedings

1 that is why I pointed that out so that whatever decision I
2 make will not be dependent on a non-professional medical
3 person's medical prognosis for the future.

4 I said it respectfully, but I do grasp that point.

5 MS. SPRINGER: Okay.

6 THE COURT: You know, I take that part of what the
7 assistant intended was that I know every time either myself
8 or anyone else who has been hospitalized gets out, just
9 getting out is kind of a boost in a familiar setting, a
10 comfortable setting. But your point is well made.

11 MS. SPRINGER: Thank you.

12 I just wanted to point out one other thing too.
13 With respect to the risk level three, if Mr. Sanchez is
14 adjudicated a risk level three, he will be subject to the
15 SARA as I mentioned.

16 But if housing or appropriate placement cannot be
17 found, even though he was granted medical parole, he will
18 remain in prison until such time that that housing can be
19 found, which is what has happened so far. That is up until
20 he reaches his maximum expiration date and his maximum
21 expiration date is not until October 20, 2030.

22 THE COURT: Look, as far as the inability to place
23 Mr. Sanchez if he is a level three, that is a terrible
24 dilemma. As I said, I have an Article 10 matter that is
25 currently being argued before the Court.

1 SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
2 COUNTY OF NEW YORK : CRIMINAL TERM : PART 85

3 -----X

4 THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK :Ind.
5 - against - : No. 745-90
6 SAMUEL SANCHEZ, :
7 Defendant. : HEARING

8 -----X

9 100 Centre Street
10 New York, New York 10013
11 October 20, 2016

12
13
14 B E F O R E:

15 HONORABLE ROGER HAYES,
16 Justice Supreme Court.

17 A P P E A R A N C E S:

18 For the People:
19 CYRUS R. VANCE, JR., ESQ.
20 District Attorney - New York County
21 BY: DAVID FILER, ESQ.
22 Assistant District Attorney

23 For the Defendant:
24 CENTER FOR APPELATE LITIGATION
25 LAUREN SPRINGER, ESQ.
MOLLY SCHINDLER, ESQ.

26
27 MAUREEN POSTEL
28 SENIOR COURT REPORTER

29
30 Maureen Postel
31 Senior Court Reporter

Proceedings

2

1 THE CLERK: Continued Sex Offender Risk
2 Assessment, Indictment 745-90, Samuel Sanchez.
3 Mr. Sanchez is not yet before the Court.

4 Appearances please.

5 MS. SPRINGER: Lauren Springer, Center for
6 Appellate Litigation for Mr. Sanchez.

7 THE COURT: Good morning.

8 MR. FILER: For the People, David Filer, good
9 morning.

10 THE COURT: So far we're waiting to have
11 Mr. Sanchez produced for the -- to be present for the
12 hearing. I take it when I say produced by video that you
13 want to wait until he's produced?

14 MS. SPRINGER: Yes, your Honor.

15 THE COURT: I just didn't want us to be waiting
16 and we're already.

17 A VOICE: Mr. Sanchez will be here shortly.

18 THE COURT: Thank you.

19 Counsel, is that Mr. Sanchez?

20 MS. SPRINGER: Yes.

21 THE DEFENDANT: Good morning, I'm waiting for my
22 lawyer.

23 MS. SPRINGER: My colleague, Molly Schindler,
24 S-C-H-I-N-D-L-E-R, is also going up this morning to sit
25 with him as part of the hearing.

Maureen Postel
Senior Court Reporter

Proceedings

3

1 THE COURT: Ms. Springer, do you know where your
2 colleague is?

3 THE DEFENDANT: They went to go get her.

4 MS. SPRINGER: They went to go get her. She had
5 an appointment at 9:00 a.m. with someone else at the
6 facility.

7 THE COURT: Okay, we'll wait.

8 MS. SCHINDLER: Sorry for the delay.

9 THE COURT: That's all right.

10 Ms. Springer, you have the witness you wish to
11 call?

12 MS. SPRINGER: Yes, I do. I'd like to call
13 Dr. John Hammer to the stand.

14 THE COURT: H-A-M-M-E-R?

15 MS. SPRINGER: Yes.

16 THE OFFICER: Raise your right hand.

17 THE CLERK: Do you solemnly swear the testimony
18 that you give now will be the truth, the whole truth, and
19 nothing but the truth so help you God?

20 THE WITNESS: I do.

21 THE OFFICER: State your first name and last
22 name and spell your last name for the Reporter.

23 THE WITNESS: John Hammer, H-A-M-M-E-R.

24 THE COURT: Okay.

25

1 DIRECT EXAMINATION

2 BY MS. SPRINGER:

3 Q I'm going to ask that when you speak you use the
4 microphone so that Mr. Sanchez can hear you, which is one of
5 the things that we were cognizant. So we're trying to make
6 sure that he can hear us.

7 What do you do for a living, Dr. Hammer?

8 A I'm a physician in internal medicine.

9 Q Internal medicine.

10 What kind of training have you had?

11 A I attended medical school in 1980, graduated 1980,
12 that was followed by Fifth Pathways, which is the program
13 which proceeds residency for foreign medical graduates. I did
14 a residency in internal medicine in Booth Memorial Hospital.

15 Q What school did you graduate from?

16 A Far Eastern University.

17 Q Where is that?

18 A The Philippines.

19 Q So you said you graduated in 1980?

20 A Right.

21 Q And are you licensed in New York state?

22 A Yes, I am.

23 Q And when did you get your license?

24 A I believe it was 1982.

25 Q Where are you currently employed?

1 A New York State Department of Corrections, Fishkill
2 Correctional facility in Beacon, New York.

3 Q How long have you been employed there?

4 A I've been there since 2004.

5 Q And where else have you worked?

6 A I've been in private practice since 1991. In 2004
7 when I began working part-time at the prison I gradually
8 phased out the internal medicine practice and I think totally
9 finished that in 2010.

10 Q And what are your duties and responsibilities in your
11 current position?

12 A At Fishkill Corrections Facility I've been in charge
13 of the Long Term Care Unit since 2004 for the past year or so.
14 I've also been responsible for the Unit for the Cognitively
15 Impaired, and more recently I've also had to cover the
16 infirmary. We have somewhat of a staff shortage for the
17 moment, but for the most part the Long Term Care Unit.

18 Q And do you know Mr. Samuel Sanchez, which is DIN
19 number 91A5961?

20 Is it difficult to hear me?

21 A There is, I'm getting it.

22 MS. SPRINGER: Can you hear me, Mr. Sanchez?

23 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

24 Q So, I'm sorry, so how do you know Mr. Sanchez?

25 A Mr. Sanchez first came to the Long Term Care Unit in

1 late December 2009, shortly after his stroke. He stayed 'till
2 somewhere in 2011 when he was transferred to the Unit for the
3 Physically Disabled at Greenhaven Correctional Facility. He
4 returned to us in November 2015.

5 Q And how are you involved -- how are you involved in
6 Mr. Sanchez' care?

7 A Well, all the patients under Long Term Care Unit,
8 there are 30 of them, I'm responsible for their care;
9 referrals for specialists if it's so needed, and any medical
10 issues that arise concerning any of the inmates there would be
11 my responsibility to handle.

12 Q And what can you please tell us about Mr. Sanchez'
13 medical condition?

14 A Well, Mr. Sanchez has a number of conditions. If we
15 want to begin chronologically we might say that he has
16 neurogenic bladder.

17 Q What does that mean?

18 A It means that he is unable to sense that when he has
19 to urinate. The nerve supply to the bladder has been damaged.
20 And I believe that was from a gun shot wound in the distant
21 past. As a consequence he has to self catheterize in order to
22 urinate. Since he can't feel the urge to urinate he relies on
23 what we call a shake away. It's a little alarm that vibrates,
24 and he can set it to any interval of hours, and based on that
25 he would catheterize himself.

1 He also has the stroke as we mentioned. That occurred in
2 2009, December. As a result of that he's paralyzed on the
3 right side.

4 He also has severe degenerative joint disease, especially
5 involving the lumbosacral spine for which he uses a TENS Unit,
6 which is an electronic device that helps to relieve pain.

7 He has hypertension, his cholesterol is a little high. He
8 has a pace maker for erythema.

9 He has sleep apnea for which he uses his C-PAP machine,
10 which is a continued positive pressure breathing device at
11 night.

12 He has obesity, that's something that comes with the
13 stroke and immobility and sedentary lifestyle.

14 THE COURT: What was the last issue?

15 THE WITNESS: Obesity.

16 Q And you said it comes with the stroke?

17 A It comes from sedentary lifestyle, which is very easy
18 to happen in prison, especially if you had a stroke and you're
19 mobility is limited.

20 He also has a severe bilateral hearing loss for which he
21 uses special hearing aides that are wireless. I think I
22 probably covered everything with that.

23 Q How much of the obesity is connected to his diet?

24 A Well, in the prison system many diets are available.
25 We have a dietitian who oversees this sort of thing. But the

1 inmates are able to change their diet, and they can choose a
2 diet that may not be appropriate for them in certain cases.
3 It's been my observation that in general the calories that are
4 provided in the regular diet usually far exceed what an
5 individual would need on a daily basis. So the tendency to
6 gain weight is there.

7 Inmates are also able to purchase what we call commissary.
8 These are items that they can buy on there own. And they
9 usually come once a week.

10 Mr. Sanchez I believe is on a low fat/low cholesterol
11 diet. I think he's been compliant with that. So the weight
12 gain is almost inevitably in the prison setting, especially if
13 you're hindered by lack of mobility from a stroke.

14 Q Is the paralysis from the stroke, is that reversible?

15 A No. Once a stroke has occurred, if you call it a
16 stroke that means after 24 hours the neurological deficits
17 that have occurred are no longer reversible. If they do
18 reverse themselves within 24 to 48 hours then its called a
19 TIA, transient ischemic attack.

20 Mr. Sanchez' deficits are permanent.

21 Q What are his physical capabilities or limitations?
22 What can he do, physically or not do?

23 A Well, he's able to transfer himself from bed to chair
24 with minimal or no assistance. He's able to shower himself.
25 He can perform most of what we call ADLs. Activities of daily

1 living without assistance. So he's fairly independent in that
2 sense.

3 But once in the wheelchair he has difficulty immobilizing
4 himself. He has the use of only the left arm, and some people
5 in wheelchairs can propel themselves to some degree using
6 their good leg. But he's very limited in that capacity. So
7 he usually needs help in pushing the wheelchair.

8 Q Can you describe a typical day for Mr. Sanchez? I
9 don't know if you see him on a daily basis. I guess what I'm
10 asking do you know how he spends his days? Is he usually in
11 wheelchair, in bed? Do you have any idea?

12 A Fair idea, I see him almost everyday. I pass the
13 room a dozen, at least, everyday. He spends a lot of his time
14 in the room.

15 We do encourage inmates to get out of the bed. And even
16 if they're not limited by a stroke a tendency is to spend more
17 hours in the bed than you normally would.

18 But Mr. Sanchez gets up when he can. When he's in the
19 wheelchair he gets assistance to the day room. And, again, he
20 can transfer himself, so I think he's limited in the number of
21 hours he can stay in the chair due to his back pain. That
22 comes from the degenerative disc disease.

23 Q Is that arthritis? Is that something like arthritis?

24 A It's arthritis, it's some misalignment of the spine
25 you might say, things that occur with age, mostly arthritic

1 type of issues.

2 Q And what medications does Mr. Sanchez take?

3 A Well, it's hard for me to recall everything off the
4 top of my head. He's on antihypertensive medication.

5 Q I'm sorry?

6 A Blood pressure, antihypertensive, he's on pain
7 medication. He's on medicine to lower his cholesterol,
8 something to help with urination I believe.

9 THE COURT: How old is Mr. Sanchez?

10 MS. SPRINGER: You're still 54, Mr. Sanchez?

11 You haven't had a birthday since the last hearing, right,
12 54?

13 THE DEFENDANT: Yes.

14 MS. SPRINGER: Yes, 54 years old.

15 THE COURT: Thank you.

16 Q What would happen -- he takes these medications on a
17 daily basis?

18 A Yes, he does.

19 Q What would happen if he stopped taking these
20 medications?

21 A Well, all the risk factors that produced a stroke
22 would reassert themselves and he might have another stroke or
23 heart attack.

24 Q And Mr. Sanchez has been in a wheelchair since having
25 the stroke, so that goes back to 2009 or he's always been in a

1 wheelchair since --

2 A Yes.

3 Q And what are your expectations for Mr. Sanchez'
4 physical progress? What do you expect to happen in the future
5 with him physically?

6 MR. FILER: Objection, I'm not -- I'm unclear.
7 Does she mean within the prison system, once he gets out?
8 I'm not sure what we're getting at here.

9 MS. SPRINGER: Oh, we'll break it; up in the
10 prison system.

11 A What are my expectations?

12 Q Yeah, if he stays in the prison system?

13 A In terms of changes?

14 Q Yeah, what kind of changes would you expect in the
15 prison system if he just stays in prison? Do you expect his
16 condition to get better?

17 THE COURT: I know it's hard for the witness is
18 over here.

19 A In terms of his physical conditions, none of the
20 things we mentioned will show improvement. He could lose
21 weight with proper dietary guidance and caloric restriction.
22 But the stroke can't been reversed. The hearing can't be
23 corrected. But the hearing aides will probably help with
24 that. In other words, I don't expect him to gain anymore
25 mobility than he already has.

1 Q What would surgery -- and you said that the paralysis
2 was permanent, so surgery would not improve -- he wouldn't be
3 able to regain his ability to move with surgery?

4 MR. FILER: Objection, again, I'm not sure if
5 we're talking about current environment or upon his
6 release?

7 MS. SPRINGER: We can break it up.

8 MR. FILER: Okay. So let's break it up.

9 THE COURT: I appreciate that parties don't seem
10 to feed on each other, they resolve things by themselves
11 when there's an objection. But the objection is
12 sustained. You can rephrase it.

13 I think it's clear that, at least, initially
14 Counsel is asking a series of questions, assuming that
15 the defendant remains in prison. And then if she wishes
16 she can ask a second series of questions if the defendant
17 is released. So the objection is sustained.

18 Q Assuming Mr. Sanchez remains in prison, is there any
19 possibility of his physical condition improving?

20 A I think not.

21 MR. FILER: Objection, because I'm not sure what
22 "physical condition" means. Are we talking about the
23 stroke? Are we talking about the sleep apnea? Are we
24 talking about back pain, weight loss, his general
25 physical condition? Again, I don't believe --

1 THE COURT: The objection is sustained. If you
2 could break it down?

3 Q I'm going to go through the list of medical
4 conditions that you said that Mr. Sanchez is suffering from.
5 The question is this, assuming that he remains in prison, is
6 there any possibility of his neurogenic bladder improvement?

7 A None.

8 Q Any possibility, assuming he remains in prison, any
9 possibility of the paralysis that he has, if he remains in
10 prison improving?

11 A None.

12 Q Any possibility of the degenerative joint disease
13 improving, assuming he remains in prison?

14 A None.

15 Q Assuming he remains in prison, is there any
16 possibility of his hypertension improving?

17 A Well, with medication it's controlled.

18 Q Assuming that he remains in prison, is there any
19 possibility of his high cholesterol condition improving?

20 THE COURT: You said assuming he remains in
21 prison?

22 Q Assuming he remains in prison?

23 A As long as he remains compliant with his medication
24 it shouldn't worsen, that's also controlled.

25 Q Assuming he remains in prison, is there any

1 possibility of his erythema improving?

2 A Again, that's difficult to say. With time things can
3 happen, but he has the pace maker.

4 Q Assuming he remains in prison, any possibility of his
5 sleep apnea improving?

6 A I wouldn't expect that to improve, but, again, he
7 uses the C-PAP machine, that also is stable.

8 Q Assuming he remains in prison, is there any
9 possibility of him dealing with his obesity issues of him
10 losing weight?

11 A That's a possibility.

12 Q Assuming he remains in prison, is there any
13 possibility of his severe bilateral hearing loss improving?

14 A None.

15 Q Now, I am going to switch to when should he be
16 released. When he's released I'm going to go through --

17 THE COURT: There might be an easier way.

18 Assuming the defendant is out of prison would your
19 answers to any of those questions just asked of you be
20 different?

21 THE WITNESS: I think not, no.

22 Q Now, I understand Mr. Sanchez was granted medical
23 parole?

24 A That is correct.

25 Q What was your involvement in that process?

1 A I submitted the certification, its called. And this
2 is addressed to the chief medical officer, Dr. Coningsman.
3 And on that form it illustrates the diagnosis, and if the
4 conditions are expected to remain stable, deteriorate or
5 improve, and any change in his condition which may have
6 occurred since the last application. This is submitted then
7 to the chief medical officer who either approves or
8 disapproves. If he disapproves then it stops there. If he
9 approves then it goes on to the parole board for that
10 approval.

11 MS. SPRINGER: Sorry, I was just looking for the
12 medical parole, application report that you had produced.

13 THE COURT: You want the minutes before --

14 MS. SPRINGER: I have the --

15 THE COURT: You want the minutes?

16 MS. SPRINGER: No, there was actual --
17 Dr. Hammer's parole report, I mean medical parole
18 evaluation. So it was separate from the minutes. But I
19 had submitted it to the Court and given a copy to the ADA
20 for the last appearance.

21 THE COURT: I have a New York State Department
22 Correctional Services Health Service System medical
23 problem history, is that what you were referring to or
24 something else?

25 MS. SPRINGER: Yeah, it's connected to that,

1 yes. Medical problems and listed in the back of that I
2 believe, yeah.

3 THE COURT: You want my copy or you have your
4 copy?

5 MS. SPRINGER: Yes, can I borrow your copy
6 actually? Because I would like Dr. Hammer to read it
7 while we're --

8 Q This is a copy of the document, the comprehensive
9 medical summary. Is this something that you prepared? It's
10 at the back.

11 THE COURT: Counsel, you got to speak in the
12 microphone. You can move the microphone.

13 A I don't see the medical parole application.

14 Q No, not the Medical Parole Application. Did you
15 prepare the Comprehensive Medical Summary?

16 A No, I signed it at the end, but that's usually done
17 by the nurse whose name is above mine.

18 Q Okay, so the nurse prepared it.

19 Okay, so did you review what the nurse did?

20 A Oh, yeah, absolutely, I assisted in filling this form
21 out.

22 Q Okay.

23 A This is what's called a -- we call a CMS. Any time a
24 patient is transferred to or from a Correctional Facility to
25 our unit he comes with a CMS. And when you apply for medical

1 parole you have to include one of these.

2 Q This is what was included in the medical parole?

3 A Well, I signed it March 2nd. It could be I'd have to
4 see the medical parole application to see the date on that.
5 It could very well be the one.

6 Q Okay.

7 So in terms of reviewing the Comprehensive Medical
8 Summary --

9 A I believe a lot of it we had gone over today in
10 court.

11 Q Can we do the diagnosis? You said you listed what
12 was chronic conditions, what had shown continued
13 deterioration, right? Is that information still accurate as
14 far as his present condition?

15 A Yes.

16 Q On page three was noted about the kind of care that
17 Mr. Sanchez would need on the level of care application. It's
18 noted that he's been assessed for residential health care
19 placement. Could you explain that a little bit?

20 A Well, again, these CMS forms that we're scrutinizing
21 now could be improved quite a bit. This particular section,
22 part two, Residential Health Care Placement would imply either
23 a nursing home, skilled nursing facility or assisted living.
24 So this is broader than it would necessarily be. In other
25 words, there's more specific categories under that.

1 Q What's your understanding of what Mr. Sanchez
2 actually needs?

3 A Well --

4 Q What kind of care does he need?

5 A I would think that he would do well in a nursing home
6 setting given all the conditions we spoke about, the
7 limitations of the stroke. He is relatively young you might
8 say for that sort of environment. But he possibly could meet
9 these needs in a family situation, depending if there was
10 wheelchair accessibility and, you know, people to attend to
11 needs as they might arise.

12 Q So it's possible he could live in a residential with
13 family then, it's possible?

14 A It's possible.

15 Q What kind of care would he need if he resided with
16 family?

17 A Well, he'd need someone to be there observing him a
18 good portion of the day, if not the entire day. He does need
19 to have access to the urinary catheters. He occasionally
20 needs batteries for his hearing aides or TENS Unit. The TENS
21 Unit has special adhesive attachments, you might call it, that
22 need to be changed each day. As I said, he's independent in
23 his ADLs, but we need someone to do the cooking and the
24 cleaning and the laundry and that sort of thing.

25 Q Does he need help with showering?

1 A He showers pretty much independently.

2 Q Does he need help with grooming?

3 A Grooming, no.

4 Q And when you say "someone would need to observe him a
5 good portion of the day", how long would -- how long can he be
6 left on his own, or would it be wise to leave him on his own?

7 A It's a hard thing to say. You're looking at someone
8 who has had a stroke. If some mishap occurred, anything
9 occurring in the house, a fire, a need to leave the house for
10 other reasons, someone would need to be there most likely to
11 assist him with that.

12 Q But in your assessment what would be the ideal
13 setting for him.

14 A I would have to say, ideally, some sort of assisted
15 living, even a step down from a skilled nursing home.

16 Q What would be the difference between assisted living
17 and a skilled nursing home?

18 A Well, the level of care mainly. Someone in the
19 assisted living is fairly independent. They usually go
20 shopping on their own. Sometimes they have their own
21 transportation. This wouldn't be the case here. But it's
22 assisted living for people who are more or less independent.

23 Q You've had an opportunity -- you mentioned that you
24 see Mr. Sanchez daily in the prison. You had an opportunity
25 to basically observe how he interacts with the staff, how he

1 interacts with you; has he ever been sexually inappropriate
2 with the staff as far as you've known him or since he's been
3 under your care?

4 A I didn't catch -- has he been --

5 Q What are his interactions with his staff like?

6 MR. FILER: Objection, objection.

7 Q You know the answer to the question is this, is he
8 sexually inappropriate with the staff?

9 MR. FILER: Objection.

10 A No, I never witnessed anything of that nature, no.

11 Q On the same Comprehensive Medical Summary there's a
12 section that says behavioral status, it's checked appropriate.
13 This is page two. Do you have any idea what that would be
14 referring to?

15 A I'm sorry, what are we looking --

16 Q Page two, Comprehensive Medical Summary, CMS, item
17 number seven.

18 A Behavioral status?

19 Q Yes.

20 A Appropriate is checked.

21 Q What does that mean?

22 MR. FILER: Objection, again, I'm not sure if
23 the Doctor filled out this form or how he can comment on
24 what somebody else checked on the form.

25 A Well --

Proceedings

21

1 THE COURT: Objection is overruled.

2 A I recognize the check. It was myself who checked
3 that particular box.

4 What does that mean?

5 Q Yes.

6 A Well, again, the words sort of speak for themselves.
7 He has not been inappropriate in any way in terms of using
8 profanity or -- well, disruptive behavior of any sort.

9 Q Are you aware of any incidents where he's been
10 aggressive with the staff?

11 A I'm not aware of any such incident, no.

12 Q Now, you've mentioned before, okay, in a conversation
13 with me, but also in court you mentioned, okay, you knew
14 Mr. Sanchez in 2009 when he first had his stroke. And then
15 you've -- he's come back to your facility in 2015 and
16 everything. You mentioned to me that he's not the same
17 person, that he's changed. So can you explain -- can you just
18 give clarification on that?

19 MR. FILER: Objection.

20 THE COURT: Overruled.

21 MR. FILER: Judge, what "is not the same person"
22 mean? It's so vague.

23 MS. SPRINGER: What do you --

24 THE COURT: No, no, one just --

25 MR. FILER: The question seems profound.

1 THE COURT: You did hear my ruling.

2 MR. FILER: Objection, of course.

3 THE COURT: Good, the witness can answer the
4 question. Go right ahead.

5 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

6 A In 2009, as I recall, when Mr. Sanchez first came to
7 the Long Term Care Unit it was immediately after the stroke.

8 When a man in his early 50s has a stroke this is a little
9 bit difficult to come to grips with, you might say. So there
10 may have been some latent anger and that sort of thing.

11 In those days he was -- you might use the term somewhat
12 demanding in terms of he needed a lot of reasonable
13 accommodations, what they're called in the prison system.
14 This refers to the hearing aides, amplifier for the telephone,
15 reach extender, which is a little grip device, which extends
16 to reach about a foot and a half and has a pincer at the end,
17 the TENS Unit, as I mentioned, for the back pain. So we went
18 through that sort of thing, but, again, it was for the most
19 part -- it wasn't disrespectful or disruptive to the ward in
20 general.

21 Q And how much since --

22 A Well, he grew a beard, he gained weight, he's a lot
23 more polite and respectful at this point, he's compliant with
24 medication, he doesn't antagonize the staff or get himself
25 involved in verbal disputes, that sort of thing.

1 SUPREME COURT OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK
2 COUNTY OF NEW YORK: PART 85

3 -----X
4 THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK : SCI NO.
5 :
6 -against- : 0079/1990
7 :
8 SAMUEL SANCHEZ, :
9 Defendant.
10 -----X
11 100 Centre Street
12 New York, N.Y. 10013
13 December 1, 2016

14 B E F O R E:

15 HONORABLE ROGER HAYES, Judge.
16

17 A P P E A R A N C E S:

18 FOR THE PEOPLE:
19 CYRUS R. VANCE JR., ESQ.
20 DISTRICT ATTORNEY
21 NEW YORK COUNTY

22 BY: DAVID FILER, ESQ.
23

24 FOR THE DEFENDANT:
25 CENTER FOR APPELLATE LITIGATION
120 WALL STREET
NEW YORK, NEW YORK

BY: LAUREN SPRINGER, ESQ.

ALEXANDER BENT
SENIOR COURT REPORTER

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 guidelines.

2 And the second factor, establishing the facts in
3 support of it's existence by a preponderance of the
4 evidence, People versus Watson, 95 AD3d 979.

5 In the Court's opinion, the defense has met it's
6 initial burden of identifying, as a matter of law, an
7 appropriate mitigating factor, and that is the defendant's
8 serious and limiting medical issues.

9 See People versus Hosear, H-O-S-E-A-R, 134 Appellate
10 Division 3d 633. That's a First Department decision,
11 December 29th of 2015.

12 The issue now becomes whether or not defense has
13 established the facts in support of it's request by a
14 preponderance of the evidence.

15 Let's talk about the defendant's medical conditions:

16 In April of 2016, the defendant appeared before the
17 New York State Department of Corrections and Community
18 Supervision Board of Parole for a hearing pursuant to New
19 York State Executive Law 259s, release on medical parole,
20 or inmate suffering significant debilitating illness. In
21 today's argument, defense counsel said he also appeared on
22 October of 2016, with the same result.

23 At the hearing, the board members reported that the
24 COMPAS risk assessment for the defendant put him at a low
25 risk across the board for felony violence, arrest, or

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 absconding if the Board took him off parole.

2 At the parole hearing, the defendant said that in 2009
3 he had two strokes. He appeared at the hearing in a
4 wheelchair, and using oxygen. The Board noted that he had
5 completed sex offender treatment.

6 And they also noted from his medical history, and I
7 now quote from page 9 of that hearing, where the Board said
8 they had a medical report on file from the chief medical
9 officer of the department, Dr. Koenigsman,
10 K-O-E-N-I-G-S-M-A-N, dated March 9, 2016; I am now quoting
11 from the minutes of the parole hearing, which were quoting
12 a report by that doctor:

13 Fifty-three-year-old male housed at Fishkill RMU,
14 diagnosis of cerebral vascular accident with right
15 hemiplegia, H-E-M-I-P-L-E-G-I-A, and history of atrial
16 fibrillation, PPM, hypertension, neurogenic bladder,
17 hearing impaired, obesity, sleep apnea, and asthma. He
18 uses a wheelchair to ambulate, requires assistance with his
19 assisted daily living needs, he is not terminal, he is
20 oxygen dependent. If medical parole is granted, he will
21 need residential placement. Recommended for parole? And
22 the doctor checked yes. The doctor recommends medical
23 parole.

24 Now, during the interview with the Parole Board, the
25 defendant expressed great remorse for his prior actions and

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 crimes. Shortly after the hearing, the Board granted the
2 defendant medical parole; what is maybe prior terminology,
3 medical parole, compassionate release.

4 Of course this Court is not bound by the Parole
5 Board's conclusions, but is aware that, by statute, the
6 Board must consider the impact of defendant's release on
7 public safety, as does the Court in this instance.

8 I credit the testimony of Dr. Hammer. He
9 substantiates the multiple serious health and physical
10 mobility issues the defendant suffers from; and they
11 include stroke, paralyzed on his right side, neurogenic
12 bladder, severe degenerative joint disease, especially the
13 lumbosacral spines, he has a TENS unit to relieve pain,
14 he's got sleep apnea, he has a pacemaker for erythema,
15 E-R-Y-T-H-E-M-A, obesity, and bilateral hearing loss.

16 Dr. Hammer testified credibly and strongly that the
17 paralysis is not reversible, that his deficits are
18 permanent.

19 He added that the defendant is able to transfer
20 himself from bed to chair with minimal or no assistance, he
21 can shower and can do most of the ADL, activities of daily
22 living, without assistance; however, he only has use of his
23 left arm, and needs help in pushing the wheelchair.

24 Dr. Hammer testified that the major physical
25 conditions or limitations will not improve, that the

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 stroke, by this time, from the date of the stroke or
2 strokes is irreversible. And the hearing, it can't be
3 corrected; hearing aids will probably help.

4 And he certainly said that weight loss is possible,
5 but Dr. Hammer said I don't expect him to gain any more
6 mobility than he already has, that the joint disease isn't
7 going away, and the bladder conditions aren't going away.

8 And the assistant district attorney is properly
9 concerned about, among other things, the risk the defendant
10 would present in an assisted living or nursing home to a
11 vulnerable population.

12 The Court inquired of Dr. Hammer if the defendant is
13 outside the prison system, if he gets great care, is
14 defendant likely to retain use of the paralyzed portion of
15 his body, paralyzed side of his body, and Dr. Hammer said
16 no possibility, whatsoever, and no possibility that he
17 wouldn't need a wheelchair to get around. And when he is
18 out of the wheelchair, the defendant does not have the
19 ability to move quickly, and he cannot remain standing for
20 any prolonged period of time.

21 So, in conclusion, the Court believes the defense has
22 identified, as a matter of law, a mitigating factor of the
23 kind or degree not otherwise adequately taken into account
24 by the SORA guidelines, and that is the defendant's medical
25 conditions and concomitant physical limitations.

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 Further, the Court finds that these are factors which,
2 if established, tend to establish a lower likelihood of
3 reoffense or danger to the community, and are of the kind
4 or degree that is otherwise not adequately taken into
5 account by the guidelines.

6 Secondly, the Court concludes that defense has
7 established the facts in support of these factors by a
8 preponderance of the evidence; accordingly, the Court, in
9 it's discretion, concludes that a downward departure is
10 appropriate, is warranted in this case, and the ruling is
11 that the defendant is a level 2 offender, not a level 3
12 offender.

13 Accordingly, the Court has prepared, pursuant to the
14 SORA law, a copy that will be placed in the file, a copy
15 will be given to each counsel.

16 The Court also finds, as it must, according to
17 Correction Law 168-N1, that the defendant is a sexually
18 violent offender.

19 And I want to make sure that the record reflects that
20 defense counsel, and the defendant here, knows that he has
21 a right to appeal this determination.

22 THE CLERK: Mr. Sanchez has thirty days in which
23 to appeal the finding.

24 Counsel, we are furnishing you with a copy of the
25 right to appeal.

P R O C E E D I N G S

1 MS. SPRINGER: Okay. I acknowledge receipt of
2 that.

3 Do you hear that, Mr. Sanchez, you have a right to
4 appeal?

5 Can they hear us?

6 THE COURT: Counsel?

7 MS. SPRINGER: Do you understand? Okay.

8 THE COURT: How do you want to handle
9 correcting --

10 MS. SPRINGER: Can we do it in writing?

11 THE COURT: Sure.

12 MR. FILER: Sure.

13 THE COURT: If you disagree, Mr. Filer, you can
14 file whatever you want.

15 MR. FILER: Of course.

16 THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.

17 This concludes everything. We are in recess.

18 * * * * *

19

20 I, Alexander Bent, hereby certify that the above is a true
21 and accurate copy of my stenographic notes.

22

23

24

25



Alexander Bent
Senior Court Reporter